UPDATE 2-3-2017

In an abundance of caution, Evanger’s has made the decision to voluntarily recall five lots of Hunk of Beef. Although nearly all product involved in this recall have already been consumed by pets without incident, we have decided to initiate the recall as a proactive measure against the remote possibility of any illness. Although only one household in the country reported illness, out of the five lots that are being recalled, we feel it is the right thing to do. This is our first recall in the 82 years that we have been in business.

The Facts: We feel that we have been let down by our supplier, and in reference to the possible presence of pentobarbital, we have let down our customers. Despite having a relationship for forty years with the supplier of this specific beef, who also services many other pet food companies, we have terminated our relationship with them and will no longer purchase their beef for use in our Hunk of Beef product. As Hunk of Beef is a very unique product, requiring very specific cuts of meat, this supplier’s meat was used in no other products.
Immediately upon learning that dogs became sick on New Years’ Eve, we launched an investigation immediately. The investigation continued for nearly four weeks, including obtaining samples of the same lot fed from the field and having them sent to an independent accredited laboratory to test for any toxin or bacteria we could possibly imagine. All of those tests came back negative. It was not until January 29th that we learned about the term, “pentobarbital.”

Something like this seemed impossible. We were unaware of the problem of pentobarbital in the pet food industry because it is most pervasive in dry foods that source most of their ingredients from rendering plants, unlike Evanger’s, which mainly manufactures canned foods that would not have any rendered materials in its supply chain. All of our raw materials are sourced from USDA-inspected facilities, and many of them are suppliers with whom we have had long-standing relationships.

Once we learned that pentobarbital was found in the stomach contents of the dog, we dug much deeper into research about the topic. What we found is that the FDA knows, and has conducted research, on the use of pentobarbital primarily in dry foods. The research can be found here: http://www.fda.gov/AboutFDA/CentersOffices/OfficeofFoods/CVM/CVMFOIAElectronicReadingRoom

In our investigation, we spoke with many suppliers to learn how it could even be possible that an animal that had been euthanized could ever possibly end up in the animal food stream. What we learned was that pentobarbital is very highly controlled, and that, if an animal is euthanized, it is done so by a veterinarian. Once this process has been done, there is absolutely no regulation that requires the certified Vet to place any kind of marker on the animal indicating that it has been euthanized and guaranteeing that product from euthanized animals cannot enter the food chain. This is a simple task, and goes a very long way to ensure safety in many areas.

Since the launch of this investigation, Evanger’s has acted as openly and transparently, sharing all test results, what we as a company were doing to continue the investigation, and all facts of the investigation. Once we learned of the term, “pentobarbital,” we spent many hours trying to find a lab that would test for the presence of pentobarbital in a meat substance. It turns out that most labs only test for this in humans. Eventually we did find a lab, and have cans currently being tested, the results of which we plan to share with the public once they are available.

In addition to fully-funding the veterinary bills for the dogs that became ill Evanger’s will be making a
donation to a local shelter in honor of Talula the Pug.

Evanger’s will continue its unwavering commitment to pet nutrition and health, and our family greatly values the incredible partnership and continued trust with pet owners in the U.S. and across the world.

Here is the FDA Press Release on the Voluntary Recall

**Evanger’s Voluntarily Recalls Hunk of Beef Due to Pentobarbital Exposure in One Batch of Food**

**Wheeling, IL – (February 3, 2017)** Out of an abundance of caution, Evanger’s Dog & Cat Food of Wheeling, IL is voluntarily recalling specific lots of its Hunk of Beef product because of a potential contaminant *Pentobarbital, which was detected in one lot of Hunk of Beef*. *Pentobarbital* can affect animals that ingest it, and possibly cause side effects such as drowsiness, dizziness, excitement, loss of balance, or nausea, or in extreme cases, possibly death.

The specifically-identified lot numbers (as detailed below) of cans of 12-oz Hunk of Beef being voluntarily recalled were distributed to retail locations and sold online only in the following States: Washington, California, Minnesota, Illinois, Indiana, Michigan, Wisconsin, Ohio, Pennsylvania, New York, Massachusetts, Maryland, South Carolina, Georgia, and Florida, and were manufactured the week of June 6 – June 13, 2016.

Although pentobarbital was detected in a single lot, Evanger’s is voluntarily recalling Hunk of Beef products that were manufactured the same week, with lot numbers that start with 1816E03HB, 1816E04HB, 1816E06HB, 1816E07HB, and 1816E13HB, and have an expiration date of June 2020. The second half of the barcode reads 20109, which can be found on the back of the product label.

**The subject recall affects 5 lots of food** that were produced from its supplier’s lot of beef, which is specifically used for the Hunk of Beef product and no other products. To date, it has been reported that five dogs became ill and 1 of the five dogs passed away after consuming the product with lot number 1816E06HB13. Evanger’s is proactively issuing a recall voluntarily so as not to risk potential exposure to
pentobarbital in the product.

All Evanger’s suppliers of meat products are USDA approved.

This beef supplier provides us with beef chunks from cows that are slaughtered in a USDA facility. We continue to investigate how this substance entered our raw material supply.

Because we source from suppliers of meat products that are USDA approved, and no other products have had any reported problems, we are not extending the recall to other supplier lots. This is the first recall for Evanger’s in its 82 years of manufacturing. Although it has been verified that little or no product remains on store shelves, if consumers still have cans with the aforementioned lot numbers, he or she should return it to the place of purchase for a full refund. Consumers with questions may contact the company at 1-847-537-0102 between 10:00 AM – 5:00 PM Central Time, Monday – Friday.

UPDATE 1-30-2017

With our common love for pets and unwavering commitment to pet health, we need to enlist your partnership in sharing true, substantiated information. It has come to our attention today that there are claims about the FDA and our food, but, as of 1:30 PM CST, the FDA has not completed any additional tests (than what has already been published and publicly posted/shared by our company HERE). Anything else that you have read online is not what has been published from the FDA. These “claims” are simply fear tactics and either unrelated or unsubstantiated claims against our company and our foods.

It has been almost once month since the incident, likely with an additional 100,000 cans of Hunk of Beef consumed by pets since the alleged incident, and Evanger’s has received no other complaints from owners whose pets experienced any similar reactions to that of the pugs. As far as Evanger’s is aware and, we believe, the FDA is aware, none of our foods have been reported to contain pentobarbital or any other contaminant.
For all testing conducted by Evanger’s, an independent third party lab has been used, and Evanger’s was never in control of the product when it was released and sent for testing. FDA uses its own in-house laboratory and has tested intact cans. Please understand the importance of that as new reports surface.

We must ask you to please access the results that have been published and substantiated from all testing to-date and share THIS link of confirmed and certified information INSTEAD OF sharing unsubstantiated information.


We cannot answer any questions about the partial report that has been posted on-line because we have not been given a copy of it even after requests to receive a copy of this information in its entirety.

We will continue to work closely with the FDA to ensure the safety of every single one of our products, and share everything we know with all of you. Evanger’s has been fielding and proactively posting information as it is received, and can be verified. Evanger’s has no intention to respond to any unverifiable reports or unsubstantiated rumors that are intended to deceive the public. We greatly appreciate your continued commitment and support.

**UPDATE 1-23-2017:**

Our promise to the public was to share all test results that were performed, as well as any we received from the family who has made these allegations. To date, we unfortunately have not seen any results from the family, but have received our final test result for Commercial Sterility. A commercial sterility test indicates if there are any pathogens or harmful bacteria present. The test result has come back as “Sterile” which means no pathogens or harmful bacteria were present in the food. We again thank everyone who waited for all of the test results before drawing any conclusions. We are grateful for the outpouring of letters from pet parents who have said our foods have actually saved their pets over the years. That is what our family works tirelessly to do as a company – produce 5-star pet food that not only improves your pet’s health, but overall well-being and longevity through clean, healthy food. We are
honored to be your oldest family-owned pet food cannery in the USA, and our family will continue the
tradition of making your pets clean, fresh, locally-sourced pet food as we have since 1935.

**HOB 1816E06HB13 Lab Test Results 1-23-2016**

**UPDATE 1-21-2017:**

As promised, we are sharing our latest test result

**HOB 1816E06HB13 Lab Test Results 1-21-2017**

**UPDATE 1-16-2017:**

We are pleased to report that results from the first round of tests have come back and **ALL 4 tests**
came back negative.  Archived by Petful.com

Our family, Evanger’s team, the general public and especially our devoted customers and fans have all
been eagerly awaiting the receipt of lab results from our comprehensive testing, so upon receiving this
information today, we are making the results public.

With our continued commitment to full transparency, the test results can be viewed here:

**HOB 1816E06HB13 Lab Test Results 01-15-2017 pt 1**
**HOB 1816E06HB13 Lab Test Results 01-16-2017 pt 2**

We hope to have the rest of the final test results available to post here by the end of this week, and we
fully expect that the rest of the analysis will be consistent with the preliminary round of testing.  At this
time, we have been unable to find any connection between the alleged incident and our foods, nor is
there any veterinary or medical evidence to support the claims of responsibility.

Our hearts go out to the Mael family for this difficult time, as well as because unkind things have been
posted on social media that have needlessly been direct at both of our families as a result of these claims. We ask that the public discontinue any and all threats and harsh words to either party, as this has been a hard time for everyone involved.

We very much appreciate the incredible outreach of support that our company and our family have been getting from our dedicated customers and retail stores who are monitoring the situation, as it has meant so very much to us as is the positive takeaway from what has been a challenging time. With 100% focus on moving forward, communication and transparency, we will continue to share test results with the public as soon as they are received.

Thank you again.

1-4-2017:

In regards to the pugs that were ill in the state of Washington, Evanger’s would like to discuss the events that occurred, and the actions that Evanger’s has taken to launch its investigation into this claim.

Holly Sher and Brett Sher (owners) learned about this at 3 AM on Monday, January 2nd, and started action immediately. As compassionate dog lovers, Evangers fully-funded the YouCaring page to take care of the vet bills, and with the donation, asked the owner to get in touch with Evangers, and to provide the lot number she fed her pets to begin an internal investigation.

We initially learned about this through Instagram. At 3:20 AM, the same day we learned about the incident, Evanger’s contacted the pug owner asking to contact us directly so that we could work together to investigate this matter. Other members of Instagram asked the pug owner to contact Evanger’s directly as well. Evanger’s has contacted the customer through Instagram, her FundMe Page with Evanger’s contribution, and the News Outlet, but had yet to be contacted by the customer directly.

Through a third party on Instagram who forwarded the information to us, we obtained the lot number of the food that was fed. The Lot Number is 1816E06HB13, and was purchased at a local Washougal, WA pet store. It was manufactured back in June 2016. We traced this batch and found that the entire lot
went to one distributor in Washington State, and no other cans from this lot would be anywhere else in the country. We asked the distributor if they had any product left of this same lot number, and they did not. An Evanger’s representative contacted all 376 stores that the distributor sells to in order to find out if any product is still on shelves.

One store got back to us, and she informed us that the pug owner purchased the cans at her store, and she still had some product on her shelf. We dispatched FedEx to pick up the remaining cans of the same lot number and had it sent directly to a third-party accredited laboratory for testing yesterday. We have offered to have the remaining unopened cans that the pug owner fed sent in for testing, and are still awaiting a response. The lab confirmed that pathogen and toxin testing will take 13 days for the cultures to show any results. Evanger’s plans to share the results as soon as it becomes available.

Although every single batch is reviewed by a graduate from the FDA Better Processing School before it leaves Evanger’s facility, we have pulled all processing records for review and have found that this particular batch was, as expected, cooked in compliance with Evanger’s FDA Scheduled File Process.

Hunk of Beef is our #1 seller. Pets consume over one million cans of Hunk of Beef per year. Evanger’s has not had one single call from any other pet parent about any pets getting sick from this lot number, and at this time, we believe that at least 200 dogs have already consumed this food. At this time, we have nothing to show that there is any issue with the food such as a veterinary report. We believe that other factors are involved that we are not aware of at this time, but will come to light when we are able to have a dialogue with the customer. We feed this same product to our own family dog, Lilly, as do almost all of our office, manufacturing, and sales personnel. We also fed a retained sample to one of our employee’s cats, being confident in our food, and the cat shows no signs of illness.

In 81 years we have never had a recall and we anticipate at the conclusion of our investigation the test results will come back negative for any pathogens or toxins.

Last night, Tuesday the 3rd, at 10:03 PM local time, Ms. Mael reached out to Evanger’s via email to notify us that 5 dogs became ill. We are grateful to have communication, and to be fully transparent, have requested that all emails between Evanger’s and Ms. Mael have the FDA in copy so that we can openly continue our investigation with scientific evidence of what truly happened in this tragic situation.

Nevertheless, we cannot imagine how terrible this must be for the owner, Nikki Mael and her family, and
are compassionate towards her situation. Evangers, of course, stands behind our products 100%. Please keep in mind that any other flavor of canned food or dry foods manufactured by Evanger’s are not affected by this in any way, and are entirely safe to feed your and our own pets.

We take safety very seriously at Evangers and are doing everything possible to determine what happened. If we made a mistake, we will take full responsibility, but are hoping that the pug owner cooperates with us and sends us the scientific evidence from her Vet that we have requested, to see if this was or was not the food that caused her pets to get sick. We will keep everyone updated as best we can as this unfolds.
# REPORT OF ANALYSIS

**For:** (7110) EVANGERS PET FOODS  
**EVANGERS HUNK OF BEEF**  
**NIKKI MAEL**  
**1816E06HB13**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Level Found</th>
<th>Reporting</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Analyst-Date</th>
<th>Verified-Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sample ID: 1816E06HB13</td>
<td>Lab Number: 12764486</td>
<td>Date Sampled: 2017-01-03</td>
<td>AOAC 972.44 (mod)</td>
<td>nla4-2017/01/23</td>
<td>ka7-2017/01/23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial sterility</td>
<td>Sterile</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No can abnormalities: no dents, swells or flippers. Vacuum = 4 pH= 6.05. No growth on PE-2 or tryptone = commercially sterile. All results are reported on an AS RECEIVED basis.

For questions please contact:

Sue Ann Selz  
Account Manager  
sueann.selz@midwestlabs.com (402)829-9892

---

The result(s) issued on this report only reflect the analysis of the sample(s) submitted.  
Our reports and letters are for the exclusive and confidential use of our clients and may not be reproduced in whole or in part, nor may any reference be made to the work, the results, or the company in any advertising, news release, or other public announcements without obtaining our prior written authorization.

---

Detailed Method Description(s)
Sample analysis follows MWL MI 204 (modified) and is based on AOAC 972.44 and the MEF (Microbial Examination of Foods). Samples of canned foods are incubated for ten (10) days to observe physical changes to the can. The vacuum pressure is observed and recorded, the can is then opened and aliquots removed for analysis of anaerobic and aerobic organisms using general nutrient broths and conditions for optimal growth. If growth is observed, the sample is reported as not sterile.
**REPORT OF ANALYSIS**

For: (7110) EVANGERS PET FOODS
EVANGERS HUNK OF BEEF
NIKKI MAEL
1816E06HB13

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Level Found</th>
<th>Reporting Limit</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Analyst-Date</th>
<th>Verified-Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sample ID: 1816E06HB13</td>
<td>negative</td>
<td>ng/mL</td>
<td>ELISA (Tetricore)</td>
<td>anjD-2017/01/20</td>
<td>bjB-2017/01/21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All results are reported on an AS RECEIVED basis.

For questions please contact:
Sue Ann Seitz
Account Manager
sueann.seitz@midwestlabs.com (402)829-9892

The result(s) issued on this report only reflect the analysis of the sample(s) submitted.

Our reports and letters are for the exclusive and confidential use of our clients and may not be reproduced in whole or in part, nor may any reference be made to the work, the results, or the company in any advertising, news release, or other public announcements without obtaining our prior written authorization.

---

**Botulinum**
Sample analysis follows MWL MI 255 which is based on Tetracon Elisa methodology. A 25 g representative sample is aseptically obtained and placed in a 225 mL of phosphate buffer. Add 150 µL of blocking buffer to plate wells and incubate for 1 hour. Wash plates with PBST and add sample to the plates, and incubate for 1 hour. Wash plates with PBST and add detector antibody, incubate for 1 hour. Wash plates with PBST and add conjugate antibody, incubate for 1 hour. Wash plates with PBST and add ABTS and incubate for 30 minutes. A blue/green color represents a positive reaction and a well with color lesser represents a negative reaction.
**REPORT OF ANALYSIS**

For: (7110) EVANGERS PET FOODS
EVANGERS HUNK OF BEEF
NIKKI MAEL
1816E06HB13

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Level Found As Received</th>
<th>Reporting Units</th>
<th>Reporting Limit</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Analyst-Date</th>
<th>Verified-Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staphylococcus aureus</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>cfu/g</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>AOAC 2003.07</td>
<td>snr7-2017/01/14</td>
<td>nrb4-2017/01/15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All results are reported on an AS RECEIVED basis. n.d. = not detected, cfu = colony forming unit

For questions please contact:

Sue Ann Seitz
Account Manager
sueann.seitz@midwestlabs.com (402)829-9892

The result(s) issued on this report only reflect the analysis of the sample(s) submitted.

Our reports and letters are for the exclusive and confidential use of our clients and may not be reproduced in whole or in part, nor may any reference be made to the work, the results, or the company in any advertising, news release, or other public announcements without obtaining our prior written authorization.
Sample analysis follows MWL MI 289 which is based on AOAC 2003.07 and AOAC 2003.11. Representative samples are obtained and added to phosphate buffer at a ratio of 9 parts media to 1 part sample (9:1). Samples are placed on 3M Petrifilm and incubated for 24 hours. After the incubation period, plates are counted and reported as colony forming units.
EVANGERS PET FOODS  
BRETT SHER  
221 S WHEELING RD  
WHEELING IL 60090-

**REPORT OF ANALYSIS**  
For: (7110) EVANGERS PET FOODS  
EVANGERS HUNK OF BEEF  
NIKKI MAEL  
1816E06HB13

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analysis</th>
<th>Level Found</th>
<th>Reporting Limit</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Analyst-Date</th>
<th>Verified-Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enterobacteriaceae</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>AOAC 2003.01</td>
<td>snr7-2017/01/14</td>
<td>nbo4-2017/01/15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salmonella</td>
<td>negative</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>AOAC 2003.09</td>
<td>nbo4-2017/01/15</td>
<td>kaj7-2017/01/16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clostridium spp</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>FDA BAM Chapter 16 (mod)</td>
<td>nbo4-2017/01/15</td>
<td>kaj7-2017/01/16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This report was reissued on 2017-01-16 11:38:27 by sac6 for the following reason: reformat report.  
All results are reported on an AS RECEIVED basis., n.d. = not detected, cfu = colony forming unit

For questions please contact:  
Sue Ann Seitz  
Account Manager  
sueann.seitz@midwestlabs.com (402)829-9892

The results issued on this report only reflect the analysis of the sample(s) submitted.

Our reports and letters are for the exclusive and confidential use of our clients and may not be reproduced in whole or in part, nor may any reference be made to the work, the results, or the company in any advertising, news release, or other public announcements without obtaining our prior written authorization.

---

**REPORT OF ANALYSIS**  
For: (7110) EVANGERS PET FOODS  
EVANGERS HUNK OF BEEF  
NIKKI MAEL  
1816E06HB13

Detailed Method Description(s)

---

Sample analysis follows MWL MI 290 which is based on AOAC 2003.01. A representative 5g, 25g, or 125g sample is obtained and placed in a stomacher bag along with a 9:1 ratio of phosphate buffer. The stomacher bag is blended to homogenize the sample. Aliquots of the sample are withdrawn and placed on the Petrifilm plates. After the plates are prepared, they are incubated for 24 +/- 2 hours to allow for growth of the organisms at 35 +/- 1C. After plates are incubated, the colonies found on the plates are counted and the levels reported as colony forming units (cfu) per gram.

Salmonella BAX
Sample analysis follows MWL MI 180 which is based on AOAC 2003.09. Samples are placed in a selective media to enhance growth of Salmonella. Samples are incubated at 35°C ± 1°C. An aliquot of 100µL is then placed into 5 mL of BHI and incubated at 37°C ± 1°C for three (3) hours. The enriched media is then analyzed by PCR for Salmonella detection.

Clostridium by FDA BAM
Sample analysis follows MWL MI 301 which is based on FDA BAM Chapter 16. A representative 25 +/- 0.5 g sample is obtained and placed in a stomacher bag along with 225 mL of phosphate buffer. The stomacher bag is blended to homogenize the sample. Aliquots of the sample are placed on pre-poured SFP plates, 12-15 mL of SFP agar is added as a top layer, swirled, and solidified. The plates are placed in an anaerobic chamber with a Gaspak and incubated for 48 +/- 2 hours at 35 +/- 1C. After plates are incubated, the colonies found on the plates are counted and the levels reported as colony forming units (cfu) per gram.